



**СЫН-ПІКІРЛЕР/ REWIEWS/ РЕЦЕНЗИИ**

**Essays on modern Tuvan culture**

(St. Petersburg: Nestor-Istoriya, 2021), 192 pp., with 4 pp.

summary in English ISBN 978-5-4469-2013-6

**\*M.B. Amalbekova<sup>a</sup>, B.E. Shagimereyeva<sup>b</sup>**

<sup>a</sup>L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan  
(E-mail: [maraluspen@mail.ru](mailto:maraluspen@mail.ru)), \*Corresponding author: [maraluspen@mail.ru](mailto:maraluspen@mail.ru)

<sup>b</sup>M. Utemisov West Kazakhstan University, Uralsk, Republic of Kazakhstan  
(E-mail: [t\\_2004@mail.ru](mailto:t_2004@mail.ru))

DOI: <http://doi.org/10.32523/2664-5157-2023-1-162-169>



Received 01 February 2023. Revised 05 February 2023. Accepted 02 March 2023. Available online 30 March 2023.



**For citation:**

Amalbekova M.B., Shagimereyeva B.E. Essays on modern Tuvan culture // Turkic Studies Journal. – 2023. – Vol. 5. – No. 1. – P. 162-169. DOI:<http://doi.org/10.32523/2664-5157-2023-1-162-169>

“*Essays on Modern Tuvan Culture*” by Ch.K. Lamazhaa, Doctor of Philosophy, Head of the Laboratory of Ethnology and Linguoculturology of Tuva State University ( Kyzyl city), Editor-in-Chief of the journal “New Studies of Tuva” (Moscow) provides the analysis of modern Tuvan culture as a kind of symbiosis, representing mutual influence and coexistence of “relics of centuries-old history, transformational consequences of the twentieth century with the Soviet heritage, as well as the ethnic explanations of the late twentieth century revivalist pathos and trends of globalisation and westernisation (Lamazhaa, 2021: 4-5).

The book contains an introduction, 9 essays, conclusion, bibliography and summary in English. The most important material on the socio-cultural life of the modern Tuva is presented in the essays, which together solve two main tasks: 1) the author’s understanding of modern social and cultural processes of Tuvan society in a historical context; 2) the author’s reflections on the trends in the development of Tuvan studies.

Ch.K. Lamazhaa’s perspective on these two issues is worth considering, because of her personal involvement with at least two cultural models of the world (Tuvan and Russian). The inside and outside perspectives on the object and subject of the research undoubtedly led to the widening of the research horizon. The author analyzes the issues of interest with a more stereoscopic view than a foreign researcher (outsider) living outside Tuva or a Tuvan researcher living in his own republic (insider) would. This heuristic position enabled the author to create a picture of modern Tuvan culture that is relevant to today’s reality.

By conducting records of Tuvan people’s current lives, Ch.K. Lamazhaa began to analyze the categories of time and space in the first *The Day Behind Tomorrow* essay, illustrating her argument with vivid examples. The researcher develops the concept of *tyva ye* (тыва ye) - Tuva time, one of the varieties of the so-called “steppe time” inherent in the cultures of the nomads of Central Asia (Lamazhaa, 2021: 10), “which surprises, even irritates visitors to Tuva, including scholars, the representatives of other cultures” (Lamazhaa, 2021: 23). In turn, Tuva’s predominantly Western European guests are perplexed and uncomfortable by *tyva ye*, while the locals themselves «see the visitors as strangers in a hurry» (Lamazhaa, 2021: 9). Although there are a number of works describing features of nomadic spatio-temporal perception (M.I. Maiskyi, N.L. Zhukovskaya, T.G. Bortnikova, A.N. Kononov, L.P. Potapov, V.V. Tsybul’skiy, etc.), *tyva ye* today remains an integral part of Tuvan culture, as is evident from the analysis. Ch.K. Lamazhaa considers *tyva ye* in the context of labor activity and economic culture of the republic and suggests the idea of unanimity of time concept in the Tuvan language and its ethnicity. Hence, the author provides detailed arguments on the chronology (12-year cycle) which determines the exact astronomical age. Based on the research of other researchers, in particular, the work of V.Yu. Suzukei, the author discusses how Tuvans relate time and space in their consciousness to the movement of the Sun and the planets of the Solar System (Lamazhaa, 2021: 12-17). The logic of a Tuvan’s understanding of the past and future is reflected in the Tuvan language, where the names of days in the past tense can be translated as *days ahead*. As the events of the future ‘approach’ a person from behind, he does not know what will happen (Lamazhaa, 2021: 19).

Modern Tuvans are the descendants of hunters and gatherers, who still maintain the nomadic way of life in household, but they are creative people (Lamazhaa, 2021: 23) who do not welcome routine work limited by time setting. And as soon as the Tuvan time is considered as a characteristic of culture (Lamazhaa, 2021: 23), it should not be regarded as a

barrier to the future. Tuvan time as a unique feature is not outdated in the culture and cannot be replaced by a common understanding of time as a value or an abstract chronometer which we, the people of the XXI century, must fit. It will last as long as culture and its language exist (Lamazhaa, 2021: 162). This fact requires foreign visitors to adapt to tuva ye, while Tuvans travel outside the republic to adjust to the “temporary” traditions of foreign societies.

The second essay, entitled “*A new space for old connections: get on and offline and get together on phones*”, is devoted to the analysis of the issue of interaction and the mutual influence of archaic traditions and modern reactions of Tuvans transmitted by information communications. This issue is covered by Ch.K. Lamazhaa through the analysis of modern communication technologies that have changed people’s lives and become “conductors of archaization, the process of returning to archaic social and cultural connections and meanings” (Lamazhaa, 2021: 25). Based on the data of the 205 respondent-survey carried out in January 2021, the researcher has scrutinized the features of the family relations of Tuvans. By studying the impact of social networks and instant messengers on people, the scientist focuses on the positive side of new communication types for Tuvans, who, like the rest of the world, are successfully exploiting them. “The most important thing for Tuvans was that the online space allowed them to maintain significant and old connections with their relatives and compatriots. Even though the methods of applying Internet communications by Tuvans are similar to global trends, the ethnic dimension is expressed through ethnic-social solidarity and self-organization (Lamazhaa, 2021: 41). Despite the recovery of the traditions of kinship relations being completely impossible, the evolvement of a specific virtual form of ethnicity has taken place. And the author believes this issue requires further research.

Ch.K. Lamazhaa, in her third “*For the Support of the Spirits*” essay, analyzes the Tuvan tradition *turlag dagylgazy* (түрлаг дагылгазы), hardly known to the scientific community, in which she herself participated in 2019. While defining the *dagylga* (дагылга) tradition as a calendar rite, she notes that in modern interpretation it may contain traditional elements of both prayers and a holiday, which cannot be held without the participation of shamans. Because of the traditional living principles being demolished in the Soviet era, when shamans were eliminated and a sedentarization policy was introduced, in modern times *dagylga* is carried out among each kindred group of Tuvans based on the scattered knowledge kept by the remaining representatives of the older generation (Lamazhaa, 2021: 54). However, at present, this rite, which is being reconstructed in Tuva, is perceived as a dialogue with the space of a particular locality and, in a broader sense, with the whole nature through the *algys* shamans. There is an awareness of the need to be grateful to Nature embedded in the collective consciousness of Tuvans, hence people desire to revive a closer connection with it, primarily achieved at meetings of relatives. It means that “people are reviving back the idea of strong causal relationships that are established between their actions (primarily in relation to the environment) and the consequences that follow wrong actions”. To this day, the powers of Tuvan shamans, who can punish deeds ungrateful to nature, are not questioned (Lamazhaa, 2021: 163).

The fourth “*Behind Faith and Global Ideals*” essay reveals the features of Buddhism, the second religion followed by Tuvans, which has been shaped into a specific «Tuvan» form on the territory of Tuva (Lamazhaa, 2021: 65). Peacefully coexisting with shamanism, Buddhism has become a marker of the confessional identity of Tuvans, who claim “Tuvans mean Buddhists.” To be a Buddhist for a Tuvan means to be “people of one of the world cultures, practically globalists” (Lamazhaa, 2021: 163). By analyzing the Tuvan dual faith, Ch.K. Lamazhaa

emphasizes the fact that Buddhism continues to enrich the local and regional culture of the Tuvan people, and “also reinforces the sense of religious community of Buddhist republics” in the Russian Federation (Buryatia, Kalmykia, and Tuva) (Lamazhaa, 2021: 75-76).

The following essay entitled “*From Establishing Family Ties to Social Presentation*” is dedicated to the sociocultural functions of family establishment tradition, or wedding rituals (Lamazhaa, 2021: 77), a little-studied issue of Tuvan culture. The scientific study of this rite, initiated at the end of the XIX century, was further hold in the Soviet and post-Soviet times, but it practically does not reflect the current state of affairs. The author fills this gap by describing significant changes using the analysis of the cycle of wedding rituals of Tuvans in 2019 as an example, and comparing it with descriptions of other researchers. Noting the loss of former functions, C.K. Lamazhaa says that in recent years, this ritual has been transformed from a family event, strictly established in accordance with the established rules for centuries, into a theatrical action (Lamazhaa, 2021: 96), just exposing the wealth and “strength” of a clan. Ceremonial events that used to gather families and relatives in the past now turn into self-presentations, or some sort of family exhibition (Lamazhaa, 2021: 164) with a large number of guests, despite the social restrictions that began with the spread of the pandemic. But there are also attempts from the side of the young to skip the dictates of the competitive parents or elder relatives’ aspirations by refusing “magnificent and expensive ceremonies” and often introducing “their innovations of a westernized nature” (Lamazhaa, 2021: 164).

In the “*Traditional and modern dimensions of ethnos division*” essay of Ch.K. Lamazhaa discusses the differentiation of Tuvan families according to clans, as well as on an administrative basis. Tribal division and identification are the features inherent in the Tuvan people. Having experienced all the historical upheavals, such as conquests, joining various khanates and the Manchurian Empire, and then joining the USSR, Tuvan clans living on the same territory have retained tribal differences. This differentiation is reflected in Tuvan folklore and continues to acquire new nuances associated with the present (Lamazhaa, 2021: 98-112). The study materials on this feature of the Tuvan society contribute to a deeper understanding of the non-homogeneity of these peoples, including the micro-social groups of Tuvans living outside of Tuva. As the author notes, the problems of internal differentiation of any society should not be suppressed, since the answers to them contribute to a deeper understanding of the peculiarities of the political and sociocultural lives of a society.

The “*Ideals of the Zasayan Tuvans*” essay is devoted to another problem, the migration of Tuvans, which was previously not typical for this people. The low standard of living in one of the poorest regions of Russia and the shortage of jobs is forcing some Tuvans to leave their homeland in search of a better life. The analysis of the problem relates to the results of an online survey under the title *Zasayan Tuvans: lifestyle, values and ideals* that the author conducted in 2014. This part of the study provides a bulk of information presented in tables and figures. One of the main statements made by the scientist in her research is an idea of how deep the emotional connection of Tuvan migrants with the land of their ancestors is. They not only always remember Tuva, but also take a keen interest in news from Tuva (Lamazhaa, 2021: 116). However, not all migrated Tuvans are aware of transferring the knowledge of their native language to their children, but they try to keep customs and traditions (family celebrations and rituals). Ch.K. Lamazhaa considers the close emotional devotion of Tuvans to their native land as an essential tool for further scientific research and other activities.

The “*Scientists about Tuva and Tuvans*” essay is a logical concession of the previous seven ones devoted to cultural phenomena and socio-cultural processes. In the essay the author discusses the studies by Soviet and Russian ethno-sociologists and anthropologists, including Tuvans, who studied Tuvan ethnicity in the XX century. The earlier researches commenced with a description of the processes of the Tuvan people adjusting to the Soviet identity, critical re-evaluation of the Soviet “excesses” policy, and the peculiarities of the adaptation to social reforms. In the future, as Ch.K. Lamazhaa argues, the studies should be enlarged in terms of setting up new research tasks, the solution to which will be possible in the context of attracting different methodological approaches.

In the final essay, “An outcast, or *How to make a cognitive turn*”, the author analyzes Tuvan studies, the scientific center of which has been Tuva since the middle of the twentieth century. The experience accumulated since that time has been little subjected to scientific analysis, thus, the gap was filled by Ch.K. Lamazhaa, who points out the rapid growth of Tuvan studies at the end of the XX century and the emerging stagnation in recent years.

The scholar believes that stagnation can be overcome by developing the concept of Tuvan culture, starting from the principles of thesaurus approach of Val. A. Lukov and Vl. A. Lukov. Lukov's thesaurus concept correlates with the Indigenous Methodology approach and is treated by Ch.K. Lamazhaa as heuristic due to the actualization of the subjectivity of the researcher, who recognizes objects and the subject of research and approaches to it creatively in the process of socialization. The author of the manuscript is convinced that the thesaurus approach to the study of the culture of a particular people should be carried out by a representative of this people.

The essay-structured format of the book provides an opportunity to start with the essay that meets the preferences and searches of a particular reader. We have no doubt that “*Essays on Modern Tuvan Culture*” will arouse the interest of representatives of various branches of the science such as ethnology, sociology, philology, cultural studies, and philosophy.

**\*М.Б. Амалбекова**

*Л.Н. Гумилев атындағы Еуразия ұлттық университеті, Астана, Қазақстан Республикасы*  
(E-mail: maraluspen@mail.ru)

\*Байланыс үшін автор: maraluspen@mail.ru

**Б.Е. Шагимгереева**

*М. Өтемісов атындағы Батыс Қазақстан университеті, Орал, Қазақстан Республикасы*  
(E-mail: t\_2004@mail.ru)

### **Қазіргі Тува мәдениетінің очерктері**

Философия ғылымдарының докторы Ч.К. Ламажааның «Қазіргі Тува мәдениетінің очерктері» атты монографиясы қазіргі тува мәдениетін талдауға арналған. Қазіргі Туваның әлеуметтік-мәдени өмірі туралы негізгі материал тоғыз эсседе баяндалған және жинақтай келгенде, екі негізгі міндетті шешуге бағытталған: 1) тува қоғамының осы заманғы әлеуметтік және мәдени үдерістерін автордың тарихи контексте пайымдауы, 2) автордың туватану ғылымының даму тенденциялары туралы ой-толғаулары.

«Ертеңгі күннен кейінгі күн» атты бірінші очеркінде Ч.К. Ламажаа тувалықтар санасында Галактикалар ауқымындағы Күн мен Күн жүйесі ғаламшарларының қозғалысымен сәйкестендірілген, Орталық Азия көшпелілерінің мәдениетіне тән «далалық уақыттың» бір түрі болып саналатын *тыва уе* тувалық уақыт категориясын қарастырады.

«Ескі байланыстардың жаңа кеңістігі: телефондарда... шығамыз, кіреміз, жиналамыз» атты екінші эссе тувалықтардың ақпараттық коммуникациялар арқылы берілетін байырғы дәстүрлері мен қазіргі үн қатысуларының өзара әрекеттесуі және әсерлесуі тақырыбын талдауға арналған.

«Рухтар қолдауы үшін» атты үшінші эсседе ғылым әлеміне таныс емес турлаг дағылгазы атты тува дәстүрінің талдауы ұсынылған.

«Сенім және жаһандық мұраттар үшін» атты төртінші очерк Тува жерінде ерекше «тувалық» формада орныққан екінші дін – буддизмнің ерекшеліктерін ашып көрсетеді.

«Отбасылық байланыстарды орнатудан – әлеуметтік таныстырылымға дейін» атты эссе тува мәдениетінің аз зерттелген нысаны – отбасының немесе үйлену салтының пайда болуы дәстүрінің әлеуметтік-мәдени функцияларын айқындауға арналған.

«Этникалық бөліністерге қатысты ескі және жаңа көзқарастар» атты эсседе Тува отбасыларын рулар, сондай-ақ әкімшілік белгілері бойынша саралау мәселесі қарастырылады.

«Саян сырты тувалықтарының мұраттары» эссесі басқа бір аз зерттелген – іс жүзінде бұрын тува халқына тән болмаған көші-қон мәселесіне арналған.

«Ғалымдар Тува және тувалықтар туралы» атты сегізінші эссе мәдени құбылыстар мен әлеуметтік-мәдени үдерістерге арналған алдыңғы жеті эссені қисынды түрде жалғастырады.

«Өз ортасына жат жандар немесе танымдық кері бұрылысты қалай жасау керек» атты соңғы эсседе автор XX ғасырдың ортасынан бастап ғылыми орталығы заңды түрде Тува болып саналатын туватану ғылымын талдайды. Сол уақыттан бері жинақталған тәжірибе ғылыми рефлексияға аз ұшырады және бұл олқылықтың орнын толтыра отырып, Ч.К. Ламажаа XX ғасырдың соңына қарай туватанудың қарқынды дамығанын, ал соңғы жылдары тоқырай бастағанын атап өтеді.

Кітапты эсселер жанрында құрылымдау оны нақты оқырманның өз қалауы мен ізденісіне сәйкес келетін эсседен бастап оқуына мүмкіндік береді. «Қазіргі Тува мәдениетінің очерктері» атты еңбектің этнология, әлеуметтану, филология, мәдениеттану, философия сияқты білім салаларының өкілдері үшін қызықты болары сөзсіз.

**\*М.Б. Амалбекова**

*Евразийский национальный университет имени Л.Н. Гумилева, Астана, Республика Казахстан  
(E-mail: maraluspen@mail.ru)*

*\*Автор для корреспонденции: maraluspen@mail.ru*

**Б.Е. Шагимгереева**

*Западно-Казахстанский университет имени М. Утемисова, Уральск, Республика Казахстан  
(E-mail: t\_2004@mail.ru)*

**Очерки современной тувинской культуры**

**(Санкт-Петербург: Нестор-История, 2021), 192 с., с резюме на английском 4 стр.**

**ISBN 978-5-4469-2013-6**

**Краткое содержание рецензии.** Монография доктора философских наук Ч.К. Ламажаа «Очерки современной тувинской культуры» представляет собой анализ современной тувинской культуры. Основной материал по социокультурной жизни современной Тувы изложен в

девяти очерках, которые в совокупности решают две основные задачи: 1) осмысление автором современных социальных и культурных процессов тувинского социума в историческом контексте, 2) размышления автора о тенденциях развития тувиноведения.

В первом очерке «День позади завтрашнего дня» Ч.К. Ламажаа рассматривает категорию тувинского времени *тыва уе*, одного из разновидностей так называемого «степного времени», присущего культурам кочевников Центральной Азии, которое соотносено в сознании тувинцев с движением Солнца и планет Солнечной системы в масштабах Галактик.

Второй очерк «Новое пространство старых связей: выйдем, зайдем, соберемся ... в телефонах» посвящен анализу темы взаимодействия и взаимовлияния архаических традиций и современных реакций тувинцев, передаваемых информационными коммуникациями.

В третьем очерке «За поддержкой духов» представлен анализ мало известной научному миру тувинской традиции *турлаг дагылгазы*.

Четвертый очерк «За верой и глобальными идеалами» раскрывает особенности второй религии – буддизма, укрепившегося на территории Тувы в особой «тувинской» форме.

Очерк «От установления семейных связей до социальной презентации» посвящен социокультурным функциям традиции появления семьи, или свадебной обрядности – малоизученному объекту тувинской культуры.

В очерке «Старые и новые ракурсы делений этноса» рассматривается проблема дифференциации тувинских семей по родам, а также по административному признаку.

Очерк «Идеалы засаянских тувинцев» посвящен другой мало изученной проблеме – миграции тувинцев, ранее практически не характерной этому народу.

Восьмой очерк «Ученые о Туве и тувинцах» логически продолжает предыдущие семь очерков, посвященных культурным явлениям и социокультурным процессам.

В последнем очерке «Чужие среди своих, или Как совершить познавательный разворот» автор анализирует тувиноведение, научным центром которого с середины XX в. по праву считается Тува. Накопленный с этого времени опыт мало подвергался научной рефлексии, и этот пробел восполняет Ч.К. Ламажаа, отмечая бурный рост тувиноведения в конце XX в. и наметившийся застой в последние годы.

Структурирование книги в жанре очерков предоставляет возможность начать чтение книги с того очерка, который отвечает предпочтениям и поискам конкретного читателя. «Очерки современной тувинской культуры» будут интересны представителям таких отраслей знания, как этнология, социология, филология, культурология, философия.

#### **Information about authors:**

*Amalbekova Maral Bimendievna*, Doctor of Philological Sciences, Professor, Department of Translation Theory and Practice, L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, 2 K. Satpayev str., Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan.

ORCID 0000-0002-4003-3080

*Shagimgereyeva Bakytgul Ersainovna*, Candidate of Philological Sciences, Department of Russian Philology, M. Utemisov West Kazakhstan University, 162 N. Nazarbayev str., Uralsk, Republic of Kazakhstan.

ORCID – 0000-0003-4391-0613

**Авторлар туралы мәлімет:**

*Амалбекова Марал Бимендиевна*, филология ғылымдарының докторы, профессор, аударма теориясы мен практикасы кафедрасы, Л.Н. Гумилев атындағы Еуразия ұлттық университеті, Қ. Сәтбаев көшесі, 2, Астана, Қазақстан Республикасы.

ORCID 0000-0002-4003-3080

*Шагимгереева Бакытгуль Ерсаиновна*, филология ғылымдарының кандидаты, орыс филология кафедрасы, М. Өтемісов атындағы Батыс Қазақстан университеті, Н. Назарбаев даңғылы, 162, Орал, Қазақстан Республикасы.

ORCID – 0000-0003-4391-0613

**Сведения об авторах:**

*Амалбекова Марал Бимендиевна*, доктор филологических наук, профессор, кафедра теории и практики перевода, Евразийский национальный университет имени Л.Н. Гумилева, ул. К. Сатпаева, 2, Астана, Республика Казахстан.

ORCID 0000-0002-4003-3080

*Шагимгереева Бакытгуль Ерсаиновна*, кандидат филологических наук, кафедра русской филологии, Западно-Казахстанский университет имени М. Утемисова, пр. Н. Назарбаева, 162, Уральск, Республика Казахстан.

ORCID – 0000-0003-4391-0613